

**Agenda**  
**City of Crystal Lake Park**  
**Planning & Zoning Commission / Architectural Review Board Meeting**  
**Frontenac Municipal Complex 10555 Clayton Road, St. Louis, MO 63131**  
**September 8, 2011 at 7:00 p.m.**

**Architectural Review Board**

- I. Call to Order
- II. Roll Call
- III. Approve Agenda
- IV. Approval of April 14, 2011 Planning and Zoning Commission/Architectural Review Board Minutes
- V. Old Business—None
- VI. New Business  
Application to the Architectural Review Board for consideration and approval of the design and materials associated with a new home at 2158 East Drive within District D of the City of Crystal Lake Park

**Planning and Zoning Commission**

**VII. Old Business**

**Amended Land Use Ordinance--Bill No. 485 / Ordinance No. 459**

**An Ordinance of the City of Crystal Lake Park, Missouri Amending Title IV, Land Use of The Municipal Code Relative to Maximum Building Heights in all Zoning Districts and the Requirement for a Two-Car Garage in District D.**

**VIII. Adjournment**

**Note: The next Planning & Zoning Commission/Architectural Review Board meeting is tentatively scheduled for October 13, 2011, at 7:00 p.m. at the Frontenac Municipal Complex**

**Minutes  
of the City of Crystal Lake Park, Missouri  
Planning & Zoning Commission / Architectural Review Board  
Frontenac Municipal Complex 10555 Clayton Road, St. Louis, MO 63131  
September 8, 2011**

**Call to Order**

Planning & Zoning Commission – Chairperson Jeff Rifkin called the meeting to order at 7:00 pm.

Planning and Zoning Commission (P&Z) / Architectural Review Board (ARB) members: Present: Chairperson Jeff Rifkin; Members Jim Gehringer, Kevin Holland, Michael Preis, Marianne Stuart and Alderperson Phillip Bryant [non-voting]. Absent: Vice-chairperson Tanya Blake and Member Tom Barrett.

Administrators: Present: City Planner Ada Hood; City Attorney Paul Martin, and Recording Secretary Jonathan Carey-Voris. Absent: Building Inspector Neil Cantwell.

Others Present: J. R. Mayer Prestige Custom Homes (755 S. New Ballas Rd, Suite 210, St. Louis, MO 63141); Dan Murphy, Murphy Realty Group Inc. (10516 Sapphire Ridge Ct., St. Louis, MO 63128); Stefan Cooke (resident of 2147 Oak Drive and owner of 2111 Grandview Drive); Nancy Brooks (resident of 2123 Grandview Drive); Katherine Moore, Assistant City Attorney, Paul Martin Associates.

**Approve Agenda**

Member Gehringer moved and Member Preis seconded the motion to approve the September 8, 2011 Agenda. The Commission unanimously agreed to approve the September 8, 2011 Agenda.

**Approval of April 14, 2011, Planning and Zoning Commission Minutes**

Member Gehringer moved and Member Holland seconded to approve the April 14, 2011 Meeting Minutes. The Commission unanimously agreed to approve them.

**Old Business - None**

**New Business - Architectural Review Board**

1. **2158 East Drive** - Application to the Architectural Review Board for consideration and approval of the design and materials associated with a new home at 2158 East Drive within District D of the City of Crystal Lake Park.

**The following summarizes the facts of the case:** City Planner Ada Hood presented her Memo to the ARB dated September 1, 2011.

The applicant is proposing to tear down the existing home at 2158 East Drive and construct a new speculative home. The proposed home will feature two stories and a front entry garage. The subject site is zoned District D and the lot measures 5,000 SF in size. East Drive has seen a few new homes developed in recent years. These new homes are out of character with the original homes.

She noted the city's Comprehensive Plan encourages a variety of housing styles and high quality materials. As a spec home, it is designed for a general audience. She noted the proposed home is 15 feet taller than the house to the south (2156 East Dr.) and two feet taller than the maximum height of 30 feet permitted in District D. The Design Guidelines were triggered because this is a new construction project. There are a number of items inconsistent with the Guidelines [having the garage the prominent feature on the front of the house, a steep roof pitch, and use of vinyl siding with stone accents].

City Planner Hood expressed concerns about tree preservation and not having received a landscaping plan for the project. She concluded by showing examples of designs used on recent renovations on Divot Drive and Cleek Court in District C as depicted in Exhibit A of her Memo to the Board dated September 9, 2011.

Members of the ARB discussed issues observed in reviewing the plans: the home proposed is a typical subdivision cookie cutter house and is out of character with Crystal Lake Park. They were concerned with the mass of the house on a small lot. It was noted this house would be out of character with the house recently built at 2156 East. They further noted that as a spec home it has no attachment to the neighborhood. It was suggested the house at 2158 East could be rehabbed or a smaller home could be built on the lot.

The builder, J. R. Mayer, said he does not see the proposed home as a "cookie cutter" house. He contended the building height was allowed based on his reading of the city's code. They were using a hipped roof to transition from the house on the north. He noted they would keep all of the trees on the north side and would only remove two trees from the front for the driveway and one in the rear yard. The remaining trees will be protected by construction fences. The house they plan to raze has a damaged foundation in the rear and on the north side. He does not think it could be rehabbed. He said that if their plan is not approved the house will be foreclosed on. In reference to the Design Guidelines, he said they are one opinion and lean more toward the contemporary style. He noted this will be an expensive home and will provide tax revenue for the City.

Members of the ARB replied that Crystal Lake Park is concerned with the quality of homes and preservation of the character of the neighborhood. It was noted that if the lot can only accommodate a two-bedroom home, the builder shouldn't try to build a larger home there.

ARB Chair Rifkin asked if they are interested in resubmitting an updated plan.

Mr. Mayer stated their contingency runs out on September 9, 2011.

Dan Murphy of Murphy Realty said it's not likely they can get an extension on their option. They looked at the last house the city approved on Crystal Drive and feel that this design is very similar.

ARB members noted this is a different situation and the other houses on Crystal Drive made it a different situation.

Attorney Martin asked the Board for a motion to approve the application:

Member Holland moved and Alderperson Bryant seconded the motion to approve the plans for a new home at 2158 East Drive and the board members voted as follows:

Chairperson Jeff Rifkin nay, Members, Jim Gehringer, nay, Kevin Holland, aye; Michael Preis nay, Marianne Stuart nay. Chairperson Rifkin declared the motion failed.

After the vote, Mr. Mayer and Mr. Murphy asked the Board to review the Design Guidelines to better define what the City wants.

Attorney Martin noted the Design Guidelines took a long time to develop with several public hearings and community meetings.

### **Old Business Planning & Zoning Commission**

1. Amended Land Use Ordinance - Bill No. 485 / Ordinance No. 459 An Ordinance of the City of Crystal Lake Park, Missouri Amending Title IV, Land Use of The Municipal Code Relative to Maximum Building Heights in all Zoning Districts and the Requirement for a Two-Car Garage in District D.

### **Discussion**

City Planner Hood explained that Mayor Taylor asked for the Planning and Zoning Commission to clarify the decision made at its April 14, 2011 meeting about deleting the requirement for having a two-car garage in District D. She wanted to be certain that the Board intended to remove the entire section that also includes requirements for garage height.

After a brief discussion, the P&Z members unanimously confirm the entire section should be deleted.<sup>1</sup>

**Vote to Adjourn the Meeting**

There being no further questions or business before the P&Z / ARB, Member Gehringer moved and Member Holland seconded a motion to adjourn the meeting. The motion was unanimously approved and the meeting adjourned at 8:35 pm.

**Next Meeting:** The next meeting of the Planning & Zoning Commission is tentatively scheduled for October 13, 2011, at 7:00 pm at Frontenac Municipal Complex 10555 Clayton Road, St. Louis, MO 63131.

MINUTES RECORDED BY: \_\_\_\_\_  
*Recording Secretary, Jonathan Carey-Voris*

ATTEST: \_\_\_\_\_  
*P&Z Commission Chairperson, Jeff Rifkin*

---

<sup>1</sup> City Planner Hod will communicate this confirmation to City Clerk Terrell after the meeting so it can be added to the Agenda for the Board of Alderpersons meeting on September 12, 2011